

Charlotte Street Market project

Annika Fritz

1. Introduction

The city of Port of Spain, the capital of Trinidad and Tobago, has been established as the administrative, political and commercial centre of the country and has emerged as the centre of business and finance for the Caribbean region. It is characterized by the historical grid pattern of roads within its uptown and downtown areas, Central Business District (CBD) (the oldest part of the city), and within some of the twelve (12) communities which lie within its boundary, based on the existing Municipal Corporation boundaries.

It is a highly urbanized area which houses 4.7% of the residential population in Trinidad. Over 50% of the land use within the city is residential. Despite these statistics, the city has been experiencing a decline in its population, particularly within its inner city and CBD. This it is argued is due to a combination of conversion of housing to commercial use and the decrease in household sizes. As a consequence, as depicted in table 1 below, it has only experienced a paltry increase in its population between 1990 and 2000 of 3.4%, in comparison to its surrounding regions (Ministry of Local Government, 2010).

Table 1: Percentage increase in population within regions in Trinidad and Tobago

Area	Population(1990)	Population (2000)	Change (%)
Trinidad and Tobago	1,213,733	1,262,366	4.0
Port of Spain City Corporation	46,901	48,514	3.4
Diego Martin Regional Corporation	91,778	105,120	14.5
San Juan-Laventille Regional Corporation	149,689	165,737	10.7

Source: Central Statistical Office Censuses, 1990 and 2000 (CSO, Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago)

This is a clear illustration of the reality of suburbanization which is one of the issues the city faces. This has given rise to urban sprawl west and east of the city and has led to the development of an urbanized strip called the East-West corridor.

This reality is further corroborated by the concentration of commercial and institutional uses, which along with industrial uses collectively occupy 42% of the land within the city boundaries. This is reflected by a concentration of employment in the downtown area, which has resulted in Port of Spain being the most important transportation hub in the island of Trinidad (Ministry of Local Government, 2010)

Street vending, a proliferation of homeless and sick persons living on the streets, poor waste disposal, increasing traffic congestion, drainage and sewage problems--frequent characteristics of urban areas, are all evident in the city which also faces flooding woes. This is aided by prevailing development practices and the inadequacy of the existing box culverts and street drains to name a few (Ministry of Local Government, 2010).

This paper presents a case study of the Charlotte Street Market Project, the achievements and challenges of which are analyzed by the application of principles outlined in the theoretical framework discussed below.

2. The governance structure of the city of Port of Spain

The Port of Spain City Corporation, one of fourteen (14) such Corporations in Trinidad, established by the Municipal Corporations Act Ch. 25:04, is generally responsible for the following functions within the city: public health and safety issues, the development and maintenance of its physical infrastructure, disaster management, a municipal police service and the assessment and collection of land and building taxes. The latter of these facilitate finance, planning and allocation of resources within the city. The work of all Regional Corporations is monitored by the Ministry of Local Government.

The powers of the Regional Corporations, of which the Port of Spain City Corporation is no exception, are exercised by its Council. This comprises the Mayor/Chairman, Deputy Mayor/Vice Chairman, Aldermen, Councilors, Chief Executive Officer, Corporate Secretary, Treasurer, Engineer and a Medical Officer of Health who collectively make decisions on behalf of the citizens within the boundary of the Municipality.

This current governance structure, as contended by the previous government of Trinidad and Tobago (there has been a change of government in Trinidad and Tobago, effective May 24, 2010) has proven to be inefficient, ineffective and unable cope with the changing dynamics of the various Municipalities. This it is argued is due to the fact that responsibilities are often duplicated by other Ministries and departments (GORTT, 2009).

Attempts were being made to transform the governance structure of Local Government in a bid to facilitate more effective quality service delivery, viable sustainable communities and balanced regional development in Trinidad. The proposed reform was guided by the principle of good governance and was built upon the platform of accountability, transparency, participation and predictability. The ultimate goal was the reform and decentralization of the system to promote more autonomy and greater citizen engagement and participation in the decision making process (GORTT, 2009).

3. Theoretical framework for analysis

No one urban planning process has been applied to this case study. Instead, a combination of urban planning principles such as sustainable development and sustainable urbanization, the principle of social learning instead of public participation have been combined with salient aspects of project management.

Sustainable urbanization can be described as a subset of sustainable development. Sustainable development as described during the 1987 United Nations World Commission on

Environment and Development is, “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.” The principle is premised on three objectives of equity, economy and the environment. While sustainable urbanization on the other hand, as explained by Anna Tibaijuka, Under-Secretary-General and Executive Director of UN-Habitat, as representing a pragmatic approach to pursuing growth in towns and cities with due regard for ecology and wealth creation with social equity. As a process, it captures the vision of “inclusive growth” that is people centric and embraces social harmony, economic vitality and environmental sustainability.

The principle of social learning as proffered by Collins and Raymond (2006) is premised on a critique of Arnstein’s (1969) definition of public participation which undoubtedly does have its limitations. They argue that Arnstein’s model was based on the idealist notion of democracy while in reality; conventional policy responses to environmental problems are only effective where there is pre-existing agreement on the nature of the problem and its resolution. This they believe is dependent on participation by a number of groups who collectively pin point the nature of the problem and its solution.

The strategies highlighted in the traditional phased approach of project management were used for the construct of the analytical framework of this paper. Key performance indicators were identified during the project execution or production stage. Mechanisms for the monitoring and compliance with identified goals were developed at the project monitoring and controlling systems stage. These were designed to ensure that the goals identified at the project planning or design stage were accomplished (Cleland and Ireland (2006)).

4. The context--prior to the advent of the charlotte street market project

Charlotte Street, one of streets in the CBD, close to its eastern boundary housed one of the first markets and the bus station in the city. It was the norm for vendors who could not be accommodated in the market, or for those who experienced slow business days to come out on to the street to sell their goods. They were often joined by many other vendors, when the market was closed, who would then sell their goods at reduced prices.

This practice over the years gave rise to an issue of effective management and policing of the city, as street vending without a license is illegal, unless a vendor has first obtained a yearly license to do so from the Council of the Municipal Corporation under the hand of the Chief Executive Officer. This issue still remains one of the major challenges facing the city due to its complexity, as street vendors can be found scattered throughout the city as they perform a service for which there is a demand (author’s field research, 2010).

The City Police attempt at addressing this issue over the years has taken the form of sporadic raids against vendors. This has proven to be ineffective in curbing the problem due to staff shortage (Thompson, 2010).

4.1 Impact of street vending on Charlotte Street

Street vending on Charlotte Street, before the advent of the Charlotte Street Market Project, lent itself to utter chaos. The vendors having no sense of permanency or order fought amongst themselves for space on the road to display their goods on a daily basis. This negatively impacted upon traffic congestion along the road as offloading was taking place in the middle of the street, thereby reducing its accessibility to a virtual impossibility. The occurrences of crime

such as pick-pocketing were high; the solid waste disposal system on the street was underdeveloped, resulting in garbage being strewn along the street (Thompson, 2010). These conditions served as a deterrent to those who were interested in conducting business in the city in a safe and secure, organized environment, thus threatening the viability of the city. It was evident that further study was needed to produce long term solutions to this issue.

In April 2008, the then Minister of Local Government, attempted to address the issues of illegal vending and lawless behavior in the city and more specifically on Charlotte Street. Discussions were entered into with a wide range of stakeholders including the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Local Government, His Worship, the Mayor of Port of Spain, the Chief Executive Officer of the Port of Spain City Corporation, some of the Councilors and Aldermen of the Corporation, senior members of the City Police, the Advisor to the Honorable Minister of National Security and senior members of that Ministry, the Central Police and the Traffic Branch, representatives of the Traffic Management Division of the Ministry of Works and Transport, a representative of the Copyright Organization of Trinidad and Tobago, the Managing Director of East Port of Spain Development Company Limited, the Manager of the Brian Lara Promenade, the Chairman and the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association and several members of the business community on Charlotte Street in light of the previous failed attempts to address these issues (Thompson, 2010).

The Charlotte Street Market Project (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”) was launched on Friday June 27 2008 after two months of intense negotiations among a collection of former licensed vendors (from the first failed attempt at introducing order and structure among vendors on Charlotte Street), the Ministry of Local Government and a steering committee headed by the Prime Consultant.

The Project was designed to address the issues of squalor, crime, congestion and chaos on Charlotte Street. There was insufficient parking and inadequate room for pedestrians. It was an unsafe place for the residents, and those visiting the area for shopping or otherwise. It was believed by many businessmen in the city, that these conditions were ideal for the spread of urban blight which had crippled the street adjacent to Charlotte Street.

The stakeholders sought to take advantage of not only the street’s position and history as a bargain retail centre, but to stimulate the economic vitality and diversity which existed among the street vendors and the traditional store owners. This they thought could be accomplished by organizing the business activity on the street, in accordance with the decisions of the Cabinet of Trinidad and Tobago (Austin, 2009). This decision was in keeping with its emphasis on creating an inclusionary and sustainable urban place. The initial duration of the Project was eighteen months, but it is currently being extended on a month to month basis while the Ministry of Local Government seeks to obtain a two year extension. The achievements and most of the challenges discussed in this paper are restricted to what transpired during the eighteen month period.

The Project initially operated three days per week, between Friday and Sunday for the first six months. Vending was subsequently allowed between Thursday and Saturday. The demarcation of the vending spaces on the street was designed by members of the Traffic Branch of the Ministry of Works and Transport supported by members of the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association and members of the business community of Charlotte Street. The design focused on the use of one lane of the street to facilitate vehicular traffic on the western lanes between Duke and Prince Streets, Queen Street and Independence

Square north and the eastern lane between Prince and Queen Streets. No vending generally is allowed within 30 feet of any intersection or in front any driveway or hydrant.

As of December 2009, there were eleven vans, one hundred and seventy-nine and a half stalls and three carts along this designated area which spanned three blocks. Each block was zoned for the sale of specific items. Block 2 is reputed for its fruits, spices and eggs, block 3 for its clothes, footwear and haberdashery and block 4 for its vegetables and clothes. Some vendors however, sell a combination of goods. The working hours of vendors are generally between 8 a.m. and 8 p.m. As of July 2010, there were 200 spaces allocated for street vending along Charlotte Street. The dimensions of a space are 4 feet by 8 feet. Some vendors occupy more than one space though, as several members of a family can come together and amalgamate their spaces (Austin, 2009).

5. The governance delivery model for the project

The Ministry of Local Government hired the Prime Consultant to undertake an urban enhancement consultancy, while the **East Port of Spain Development Company Limited** hired the same consultant to undertake an Urban Management Plan for the city of Port of Spain. One of the main stakeholders of the East Port of Spain Development Company Limited is the Ministry of Local Government as this limited liability company wholly owned by the government of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago was incorporated in 2005. Its mandate is to develop and redevelop a zone in east Port of Spain, designed to transform that area through economic, social and physical regeneration in partnership with the community, to improve the quality of life for its residents. Charlotte Street, which falls within the boundaries of the city of Port of Spain, is also the western boundary of the East Port of Spain Development Company Limited. These two entities entered into a partnership for the Project which was an aspect of the Urban Management Plan (Thompson, 2010).

The Prime Consultant, guided by the Municipal Corporations Act, and by the principles of transparency, accountability, negotiation and participation, designed a number of documents aimed at providing a framework of structure and systems for the Project. The systems designed are constantly monitored by the Prime Consultant to assess their effectiveness and to make proposals for changes if necessary. The first system was a Draft Vending Policy which outlined how the Project was going to be organized and dictated the management approach to be adopted. An application form which participating vendors were required to sign was also designed. The chosen participants were selected from a short list of prospective vendors which was prepared in conjunction with the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association. The names on this short list comprised participants from the original list of license holders from the first failed attempt at the Project.

The registration process was also developed by the Consultant. This enabled the development of a data base and the profiling of each participating vendor who was required to show a form of identification and fill in information about himself. The rationale behind the registration of the vendors was to ensure that no new vendors were licensed to sell on Charlotte Street after this exercise was completed, thereby facilitating the regularization of the vendors within a system of control.

The Prime Consultant also employed other data-gathering techniques such as questionnaires. The information gathered from the questionnaires was entered into a database and analyzed as a means of gaining insight into the issues which the vendors faced. The Prime Consultant

believed that if attention was placed on addressing such issues, the level of success of the Project was likely to increase. The skills of other professionals such as psychologists, social workers and management professionals were relied upon to first assist with the design of the questionnaires and then with the examination and the analysis of the data collected. Their expertise were also relied upon for the collection of further data as they walked the streets independently and on other occasions in conjunction with the Prime Consultant to record their observations and provide feedback. Employees of the Port of Spain City Corporation, inclusive of the Chief Executive Officer and employees of the Ministry of Local Government whom the vendors did not know were also encouraged to walk the street and provide feedback. This was promoted as it was believed that it would increase the stakeholders' understanding of the issue at hand, thereby minimizing the exclusion of the vendors and their perspectives in the process of the execution of the Project.

A Vendor's Code was also developed in collaboration with the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association. This Code contained the duties and obligations of the Port of Spain City Corporation and the rules and regulations which participating vendors had to comply with. The philosophy behind its development was to ensure that street vending was organized in such a way to promote public interest as well as the protection of public health and safety. The Code provided the foundation of the rules and regulations contained in the Licensee Agreement which registered vendors were required to sign. Some of the issues addressed in the rules and regulations included the fee which registered vendors are required to pay before the beginning of each month. The agreed amount was determined by major discussions held among the participating vendors, the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association and the Prime Consultant. Vendors' contributions range from two hundred and fifty dollars for a small cart or table to one thousand eight hundred dollars for a large van (Thompson, 2010). Twenty dollars of this contribution goes towards the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association, while 10% of the money collected from each vendor goes into the Port of Spain City Corporation's coffers. This amount of money is collected as a license fee. The remaining contribution is used for payment for other operations of the Project.

The Prime Consultant interacts with the greatest number of stakeholders in the Project which include representatives of the Ministry of Local Government, East Port of Spain Development Company Limited, L.A. Management Company Limited, the vendors, the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association, the CBD Patrol Unit, the businessmen who were part of the initial failed initiative, psychologists and social workers co-opted into the Project to help assess the needs of the vendors (Thompson, 2010).

The Port of Spain City Corporation approved the Vending Policy designed by the Prime Consultant and in June 2008, approved the issuance of licenses to vendors who met the selected criteria for the Project. This facilitated the commencement of the registration of vendors and all other processes in relation to the Project, such as the determination of the quantum and type of vending allowed to take place on Charlotte Street. The Corporation was cognizant of the constraints provided by the rules and regulations designed by the Prime Consultant which were aimed at the promotion of security and health and safety along the street. The Port of Spain City Corporation in collaboration with the Ministry of Local Government is the executing agency for the Project. They jointly are responsible for the policy direction and for the monitoring of its progress (Austin, 2009).

L.A. Management Company Limited has been contracted by the Ministry of Local Government to provide project management services for the Project. These services include managing the process for the establishment of the Project and managing and monitoring its

operations thereafter to ensure that all deliverables stipulated in its contract are achieved. This Company is also responsible for the collection of payments, the processing and issuance of licenses and the development of marketing and information campaigns as needed. The work of the Company is undertaken by thirteen (13) persons. The manager is responsible for maintaining the records of all activities undertaken during the Project and he acts as the go-between among the vendors participating in the Project, the Ministry of Local Government and the Port of Spain City Corporation and the other stakeholders in the process. He meets with the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association every two weeks to a month, with the Prime Consultant every other month and with the Compliance Officers every week (Austin, 2009).

Compliance Officers are charged with the responsibility, to varying extends of monitoring and evaluating the policies and policy activities of the Project. They evaluate actual outcomes against performance indicators and targets which were devised to suit the realities of Charlotte Street. Five Compliance Officers, hired by the Company, walk along each block of the Project area monitoring the activities of the vendors during the days designated for vending. On each of the said days an attendance register is taken to monitor the usage of the street and inspections undertaken to assess the level of compliance by the vendors to the rules and regulations governing the Project. Such assessment of compliance include their checking to ensure that no licensed vendor is attempting to sell his spot to another, the issuing of reminders regarding the renewal of licenses, the payment of fees, ensuring that the vendors are selling in their designated spaces and are selling what they were registered to sell, assisting with the settling of any issues which crop up, specific to any one vendor or a group of vendors which the block captains are unable to address (Austin, 2009).

The Liaison Officers on the other hand, were employed to provide continuous feedback between the licensed vendors and the manager. They form the first rung in conflict resolution along the street. The number of Compliance and Liaison Officers working on the Project, as of December 2009 totaled five respectively.

Two administrative offices were also hired by the Company to deal with the accounts of the Project. These workers collect payments, process and issue licenses under the Project out of the office of the Port of Spain City Corporation.

Initially, a maintenance company was contracted by the Company to undertake the cleaning of the street during designated vending days. This responsibility has since been transferred to the vendors themselves who organize this aspect of the Project (Austin, 2009).

The CBD Patrol Unit, established in June 2008 started work on the Project under the direct supervision of an Inspector of Police who was initially aided by twenty-four Special Reserve Policemen. This number subsequently increased to forty-three. They assist the work of the Compliance Officers by ensuring that no vending takes place on the street on non-vending days and support the work of the manger on official vending days by ensuring that law and order is maintained along the street. They attend to all infringements occurring within the Project which include warning and cautioning persons, laying of charges for obscene language, traffic violations, larceny, vendor/pedestrian behavior and parking violations to name a few.

The Unit operates on a six day fourteen hour week with two split shifts per day. Shift 1 works begin at 7 a.m. and end at 11 a.m. and continue from 2 p.m. to 6 p.m. and shift 2 works from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. and then from 5 p.m. to 9 p.m. Each officer works for four days every Friday and Saturday and two days between Monday and Thursday. This results in the actual patrol work

by eight to ten persons per shift for thirty-two hours, as the officers are free between the split shift. The number of patrols conducted during the study period during the day totaled four thousand six hundred and seventy-three and those by night amounted to three hundred and ninety-five (Austin, 2009).

Each block within the Project is supervised by two representatives of **the executive of the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association**, called block captains. One block however, only has one block captain. The selection of the block captains was based on an inclusionary process as the vendors identified them as their leaders. They were then trained and provided with a forum via which they could articulate the vendors' perspectives of the situation while being exposed to the aims and objectives of the Project. Their responsibility includes the management of their respective blocks by acting as conduits through which the concerns of the vendors are brought to the attention of the manager. They work very closely with the Compliance and Liaison Officers in managing the many varied issues of their blocks. They meet and discuss any challenges experienced throughout the Project with the Compliance Officers, the manager and the Prime Consultant (Thompson, 2010).

6. Finances of the project

40% of the actual operating or available income for the Project came from a fixed contract fee for the project management services which is paid per month by the Ministry of Local Government. 59% came from the vendor contributions and 1.1% from the registration fees paid. The major project expenses were generated from project management services which accounted for 43%, cleaning services, 22%, liaison services, 8% and registration and licensing services, 7.4%. A copy of the budget was circulated among representatives of the Ministry of Local Government, the Port of Spain City Corporation and the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association (Austin, 2009).

7. Achievements

The system of governance devised through social learning, unlike all other attempts made at dealing with street vending and its attendant issues, is improving the quality of governance within the CBD of Port of Spain as all stakeholders have been involved in the decision making process. Based on the governance model adopted, all are able to understand the issues facing their partners and are able to appreciate the diverse aspects of the problem. This has been facilitated by the fortnightly meetings which the then Minister of Local Government held with all stakeholders. For the vendors who dominate the street, out of 80% of the total two hundred vendors interviewed, 50% of them report that they now understand the process via which they can vent their issues and have them addressed. 85% reported that they have learnt how to be more responsible, as they have to save, budget and prioritize in order to meet the requirement to pay for their monthly licenses (author's field research, 2010)

100% of the vendors interviewed expressed relief at no longer having to run from the police in order to earn a living. They all reported that they feel more relaxed while selling to their clientele which they have developed through the permanency of their positioning. This has also resulted in improving their vendor-customer relations. 35% expressed a sense of fulfillment in understanding that their contribution is needed in order for them to secure their livelihood. 100% of the vendors interviewed stated that they feel safer on the street because of the

involvement of the CBD Patrol Unit which has resulted in reducing the incidents of pick pocketing experienced by both them and their customers (author's field research, 2010). This Unit has been enabled by the wholesale support of the Ministries of Local Government and National Security, the Advisor to the Minister of National Security and the Head Office personnel of the Police Service.

The collaborative approach to co-management enabled the Prime Consultant to liaise on a daily basis with the head of the Unit to ensure that the Unit was sufficiently flexible to meet the ever-changing demands of the Project. The Unit has been bolstered by the implementation of the split shift system, the inclusion of time for attendance at court for the officers and for the undertaking of administrative duties. This Unit has proven to be a useful vehicle for effective management of urban activity and in reducing criminal and disorderly elements. The innovation of an unofficial hotline which was used by citizens and businessmen along the street and throughout the CBD, though currently not in use, enabled the Unit to be ever more responsive to the needs of the people (Thompson, 2010).

The traditional businessmen on the street have responded to the competition of the vendors by themselves lowering their prices and by finding innovative ways to attract customers by choosing to sell items which the vendors are not selling, such as cosmetics and items for personal care. Several traditional groceries on the street are also benefitting from the upsurge of customers coming out to get bargains. Even the stores which sell the same items as the vendors seem to be benefitting from a secondary level of shopper who prefers to enjoy the amenities such as air conditioning and the ability to pay via non-cash transactions which the vendors cannot afford them. 65% of the taxi drivers interviewed report that they too are reaping benefits from the Project as they have experienced an increase in the number of travelling passengers seeking transportation to and from Charlotte Street, especially on Saturdays due to the activity and vibrancy of the street created by the Project (author's field research, 2010).

7.1 Measuring success against project deliverables during the first year of the operation of the project

Table 2 below outlines the project deliverables, the mechanisms used for their fulfillment and the general level of success.

Table 2: Measurement of Project Deliverables during the first year of the Project

Project Deliverable	% accomplished	Mechanism for fulfillment
Strategic direction of the Project	100	Continual consultation among representatives of the Ministry of Local Government, the Port of Spain City Corporation and the Prime Consultant
Continual monitoring/supervision of the Project	100	Work done by the Compliance and Liaison Officers on specified vending days
Facilitation of the licensing process, the operation of a waiting list for replacement spots and the creation of a waiting list for replacement spots	100	Administrative staff hired by the Company 178 renewable vendor licenses issued, 82 vendor assistants registered, 260 identification cards produced
Development and management of a conducive operating	95	56 weekly information notices were issued to the licensees.

Project Deliverable	% accomplished	Mechanism for fulfillment
environment for the Project and continuous evaluation of services available and required for it		Their monthly contributions were reduced in August 2008 and April 2009 for periods of three and four months respectively due the requests from the Charlotte Street Heritage Vendors Association
Enforcement of Vendor's Code	95	Compliance Officers issued 105, first warning letters for violations, 50, second warning letters and 23, termination letters. 23 vendors recorded as dropping out the Project
Engagement in continuous evaluation of services available and required	100	The Company conducted 6 mass vendor meetings in an effort to receive feedback from the vendors. As a consequence, compliance staff was increased to provide greater supervision. Cleaning schedules were adjusted from time to time to meet the specific needs of the Project.
Coordination of activities of the Project and other stakeholders	75	The Company participated in stakeholder meetings at the Ministry of Local Government and responded to requests to beautify the street for the both Christmas period in 2008 and 2009, for the 5 th Summit of the Americas, both Independence Days and for the Commonwealth Heads of Government Meeting in 2009

Source: Report on the Charlotte Street Temporary Vendors Market Project for the period July 1st 2008-December 31st 2009

8. Challenges

Amidst the many achievements of the Project during the period of the main analysis and at present, it continues to face a number of challenges; among them being, the understaffing and redeployment of staff of the CBD Patrol Unit. Though the successes experienced by this Unit cannot be denied, the Special Reserve Officers initially staffed in this Unit are part of the police division of the Ministry of National Security and are subject to redeployment at any time, often after they have been trained. By the end of 2009, there were only eight officers patrolling all of the streets in the CBD. 65% of the 80% of the two hundred vendors interviewed complained of increasing incidences of pick pocketing, illegally parked vehicles, indiscriminate dumping of garbage and the illegal use of the pavement by both store owners and vendors which is suggesting that the margin of success experienced by the Unit is being whittled away (author's field research 2010)

Charlotte Street is not pedestrianised; therefore the conflict between the vehicular and pedestrian traffic is leading to an increase in congestion on the street on both vending and non-vending days (Austin, 2009) This problem is exacerbated during periods of national festivity. The construct of the vendors' stalls provides no protection against the rain during the rainy season This negatively impacts both the vendors and their clientele and as 90% of the vendors interviewed stated it puts a strain on their ability to pay their monthly contributions due to their reduced profits. The vendors as a result argue that their contributions ought to be reduced during the rainy season. They also believe that they should be allowed to vend on days outside of those stipulated, as a means of compensation (author's field research, 2010).

50% also raised the issue of their receiving compensatory days in lieu of holidays falling on vending days. 10% raised concerns over their being required to pay a monthly contribution to vend on Charlotte Street during the designated vending days, while illegal vending is allowed at no cost to the vendors on other streets within the city (author's field research, 2010). Measures at eliminating illegal vending in other parts of the city, Austin (2009) reports have been ineffective and therefore unsustainable. Vendors participating in the Project continue to compete with illegal vendors within the city on their designated vending days.

50% of the vendors admitted to not viewing their vending as a business and failed to recognize the fact that the Project was designed to enable them to eventually move into their own businesses off the street. They reported that they should be entitled to vend on the streets from Monday to Saturday. 65% of the vendors expressed concern about whether approval had been obtained for the extension of the Project. Only 5% wore their badges as required under in the License Agreement (author's field research, 2010).

In terms of project deliverables, the provision of monthly reports to the Ministry of Local Government was low. Austin (2009) ranks this frequency at 25% as the Company was only able to submit three monthly reports and one annual report during the first year of the operation of the Project. Attempts at the development of planned marketing and public information strategies by the Company in conjunction with the Ministry of Local Government and the Charlotte Street Vendors Association was also poor. Charlotte Street was decorated as part of the 2009 Christmas marketing plan. However, no formalized marketing/public information strategies were employed during the course of the first year of the Project. This achievement was ranked at 30%. The Project is mainly marketed via word of mouth. The press has been invited on a number of occasions to interview the vendors and customers on Charlotte Street. This Thompson (2010) suggests has been an effective tool.

9. Conclusion

It is recognized that street vending ought to be a temporary state. This case study on the Charlotte Street Vendors Market stands as a testament that in the midst of challenges and evidenced imperfect circumstances, sustainable and inclusive urbanization is not an elusive goal. Its success is dependent on the strength of the commitment of the political directorate to partnering with and engaging all elements of civic society. This is necessary for the development of a collective understanding of the nature of the problems which stand as blockages to its accomplishment. This commitment must be accompanied by the provision of relevant resources, constant monitoring and evaluation and review of the policies, regulations and operations adopted.

The implementation of this approach in the case study at hand resulted in the prevention of the spread of urban blight throughout the city of Port of Spain which threatened its viability and sustained development.

References

- Arnstein, Sherry R. (1969) "A Ladder of Citizen Participation," *Journal of the American Planning Association*, Vol. 35, No. 4, July
- Austin, Lennox (2009) Report on the Charlotte Street Temporary Vendors Market Project for the period July 1st 2008-December 31st 2009
- Cleland, David and Ireland, Lewis (2006), *Project Management: Strategic Design and Implementation*, 5th edition, The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.
- Collins, Kevin and Ison, Raymond (2006). "Dare we jump off Arnstein's ladder? Social learning as a new policy paradigm". In: *Proceedings of PATH (Participatory Approaches in Science & Technology) Conference*, 4-7 June 2006, Edinburgh.
- Connor, Desmond (1988) "A new ladder of citizen participation" *National Civic Review*, Vol. 77, Issue 3
- East Port of Spain Development Company Limited (2007), *East Port of Spain Strategic Development Plan*
- Forum on Sustainable Urbanization In The Information Age 23-24 April 2008, United Nations Headquarters, New York ECOSOC Chamber, Address by, Mrs. Anna Tibaijuka, Under-Secretary-General and Executive Director of UN-HABITA
- Genivar (2007) *Central Port of Spain Master Plan*.
- Genivar. (Ongoing) *Port of Spain Waterfront Study*
- Government of Trinidad and Tobago (2009), *Draft White Paper on Local Government Reform*
- Government of Trinidad and Tobago (1984), *National Physical Development Plan*
- Halcrow. (2000), *Chaguaramas Local Area Concept Plan*
- Halcrow. (2000), *Local Area Concept Plan*
- Halcrow. (2000), *National Conceptual Development Plan*.
- Halcrow. (2000), *Port of Spain Local Area Concept Plan*
- Halcrow. (2000), *Urban Corridor Barataria to Arima Local Area Concept Plan*
- Lock, Dennis (2007), *Project Management*, 9th edition, Gower Publishing Limited: Gower Publishing Company
- Ministry of Local Government (2010), *Port of Spain Draft Spatial Development Plan*
- Town and Country Planning Division (1973), *East Port of Spain Redevelopment Plan*
- Town and Country Planning Division (1975), *Planning for Development: The Capital Region*
- Town and Country Planning Division (1987), *Port of Spain Land Use Plan*.
- Thompson, Margaret (2010), *Urban Management Plan for Port of Spain with special emphasis on the Central Business District*
- Thompson, Margaret (2010), *Personal Interview*

Author

Annika Fritz, Attorney-at-Law, Trinidad and Tobago